

MINUTES

**Historic Preservation Commission
7447 E. Indian School Road
1st Floor Community Development Conference Room
August 26, 2004
5:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 P.M.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Ed Wimmer, Chair
B.J. Gonzales, Vice Chair
Nancy Dallett, Commissioner
George Hartz, Commissioner
Kathy Howard, Commissioner
Cathy Johnson, Commissioner
Paul Winslow, Commissioner

Staff: Debbie Abele, HPO
Bob Cafarella, Director
Don Meserve
Liz Wilson

Visitors: John Packman, Ann Murphy, Faye Neely, Joe Kullman, Brian Futo, Jeri Futo,
Darlene Petersen, Janet Sell, Bill Kutschke

ROLL CALL

A formal roll call confirmed members present as stated above.

JULY 22, 2004 MINUTES

Commissioner Johnson requested corrections to the July 22, 2004 minutes. She requested the word committee be capitalized throughout the document. On page 3, sentence that reads: "Ms. Abele passed out literature on Western Theme architecture as a reading homework assignment for the commissioners" The work commissioners should be capitalized.

Commissioner Howard made a motion to approve the minutes of the July 22, 2004 meeting as amended. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Hartz and passed unanimously.

Historic Register Committee Recommendations on 1950 Neighborhoods

Ms. Abele reviewed the process used to select the neighborhoods. She reported this process has taken place over the last three years. She provided an overview of the research that has been done on the 1950 neighborhoods. She reported the Committee reviewed all of the 1950s neighborhoods at the Commission's direction and: 1) selected the top 20 neighborhoods for further study based upon initial integrity ratings; 2) completed intensive study of top ranked neighborhoods; 3) conducted house-by-house intensive surveys by teams of two; 4) selected 5 top neighborhoods for further research and evaluation; and 5) re-surveyed the 10 second tier neighborhoods to identify additional candidates.

She commented there have been several newspaper articles that would lead people to believe we are much further along in the process than indicated by the Steps to Zone Property HP chart.

She reviewed the five themes in the Scottsdale Residential Single Family Neighborhood Development Themes 1947-1960 in the draft document recently sent to the Commission for review:

Themes Associated with Events

- Growth of the Phoenix Metropolitan Area 1947-1960
- Residential Subdivision Practices in Scottsdale 1947-1960

Design Related Themes

- Residential Subdivision Design Evolution 1947-1960
- Post WWII Housing Design 1946-1960
- Single Family Home Architectural Styles 1946-1960

Ms. Abele reviewed a proposed timeline noting they have scheduled two neighborhood meetings on Wednesday, September 15th and Saturday, September 18th and there would be a presentation on the survey process and the findings at these open houses. There will be a presentation at the Mayor's breakfast on November 18th. In November or December, the Commission will receive a list of the neighborhoods considered the best candidates for designation and report on the public input. Initiation of HP overlay zoning could occur in January with hearings before the HPC in February and before the Planning Commission in March or April and to the City Council for action approximately a month later.

Commissioner Dallett stated that they have not discussed any relationship between downtown Scottsdale and the residential home construction. Ms. Abele replied that there are not a lot of direct ties other than lending through the Valley National Bank. She reported that arts and tourism was the primary driver for downtown development during this period.

Commissioner Hartz inquired that during the five years from 1955 to 1960 of the 13-year period some sort of evolution happened, that all of a sudden things were more meaningful and interesting. Ms. Abele stated that change happened over time as more people came here with Motorola and the level of income increased. The trend was for larger and more custom homes to be built in Scottsdale during this postwar period than in neighboring Phoenix or Mesa.

Commissioner Dallett requested information about the definition of the word theme. Ms. Abele explained that the language that is used is consistent with the terms used in the National Register Bulletins. Commissioner Dallett stated that we can use the National Register guidelines but craft language to communicate clearly what a theme is.

Ms. Abele commented that with regard to financing, the Valley National Bank played a significant role. She further commented that staff will continue to do interviews and research. Commissioner Dallett stated that she felt it was very important to carry on with interviews of the actual builders. It was noted that many of the builders are gone but their children could be interviewed.

Chairman Wimmer opened the meeting to public comment on neighborhoods.

Darlene Peterson stated that she lives in Scottsdale Estates 4. She further stated the people she has talked to in her area want to know what they can and cannot do with the Historic Designation. She noted that people want to know if they can add second stories and what modifications they could make to their homes.

Chairman Wimmer closed public comment. The consensus of the Commission was that staff would proceed with further research and evaluation on the top 5 neighborhoods and possible alternates.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Historic Register

Commissioner Howard thanked Ms. Able, Ms. Wilson, and Mr. Meserve for all of their help working with the Committee on the Historic Register Committee recommendations on 1950s neighborhoods.

Ms. Abele commented that in the fall the Committee would begin reviewing multi-family housing.

Education Outreach

Commissioner Hartz reported that the Committee did not meet over the last couple of months but over the summer worked on the format for the two brochures on Early Town Buildings and Arts and Tourism. Both brochures have been printed and are available for distribution. He further reported that the Mayor's breakfast scheduled for November 18, 2004 would be on topic of historic ranch neighborhoods, noting this is a good way to educate the public on this process.

HPO/STAFF REPORT AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Ms. Abele provided an update on proposed Pima Plaza HP historic district. She indicated she had met with the property owners in the proposed 5th Avenue historic district and there is support and interest for designation. Initial work has been done in ascertaining the interest of the proposed Main Street historic districts but the process will take more time because of the range of ownership situations and number of entities involved.

Mr. Meserve stated staff is working with the owners of the Pink Pony and Sugar Bowl regarding building condition assessments by architects. He further stated that Ms. Abele's contract is up in October and an RFP has been sent out to solicit proposals for historic preservation officer services. He will report on the results of the selection process at the September meeting.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS & ANNOUNCEMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENT

Commissioner Gonzales inquired about the status of the western theme project. Ms. Abele provided information on the evolution of the western theme noting that it is not limited to the West. Neighborhood activities have taken first priority for staff over the summer.

Commissioner Johnson reported that the Los Arcos sign was taken down and the Scottsdale Historical Society will store it. She further reported that when Janet Wilson was Chair of the Commission, representatives of the Los Arcos development project came before the Commission and the Commission asked them to document it for City files.

Commissioner Johnson stated that she attended the Arizona Preservation Foundation's statewide conference in July at ASU and that it was worthwhile. She further stated next year's conference will be held in Tucson. She inquired if the City could reimburse Commissioners for their registration fee to attend next year's conference. Mr. Meserve said he would look into that with Bob Cafarella. He noted that the matching funds from the State Historic Preservation Office were not available for Commissioners to attend this year's conference because other communities applied early for the limited funds that were available for this year's state conference.

Commissioner Johnson noted that Tempe and Mesa have preservation logos.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

A citizen inquired about the criteria used to place the Pink Pony on the register since the restaurant had been moved from its original location.

Ms. Abele stated the designation was based on how the building housing the Pink Pony restaurant told the history of what was happening in the downtown in the 1950s and that the historic alteration of the Scottsdale Road property was found to be eligible for register listing.

FUTURE MEETINGS AND AGENDA ITEMS

Chairman Wimmer determined from Commissioner comments that the next regular meeting date of September 9, 2004 will not work since some Commissioners will be out of town. It was agreed that the next meeting would be held on September 23, 2004 as a Special Meeting. Commissioners were encouraged to attend the September 15th and September 18th open houses in lieu of the regular meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 6:20 p.m.

Submitted by:

For the Record Court Reporters

82604min